О. Ф. ЛОБАЗОВА

Факторы развития российского рынка дополнительного профессионального образования

Результаты деятельности высших учебных заведений в области дополнительного профессионального образования не всегда достигают высоких показателей, что влияет на процесс реализации государственной политики модернизации рынка труда. Гипотеза настоящего исследования строилась на предположении о комплексе условий, в которых происходит формирование предложений на рынке дополнительного профессионального образования, и которые можно рассмотреть как группы связанных, но не однородных факторов.

Для формирования эмпирической базы исследования были выборочно собраны открытые данные, размещенные на официальных сайтах образовательных организаций в сети Интернет, которые затем статистически и содержательно обрабатывались с применением системного метода.

В результате было установлено, что предложения на рынке услуг дополнительного профессионального образования формируются под воздействием ряда объективных факторов, которые обозначены в исследовании как факторы «нормы, прогресса, рынка и моды». Применение этой модели к анализу реального состояния рынка дополнительного профессионального образования позволило сформулировать три принципа эффективной организации, используя которые некоторые образовательные организации получают эталонные результаты: дифференциация направлений, делегирование функций и диверсификация цен.

Таким образом, исследование позволило обозначить наиболее результативные направления организационной деятельности вузов в сфере дополнительного профессионального образования и сформулировать ряд положений практического значения. Перспективой исследования является факторный анализ дальнейших изменений той части рынка дополнительного профессионального образования, которую составляют государственные высшие учебные заведения.

Ключевые слова: дополнительное профессиональное образование, профессиональная переподготовка, повышение квалификации, «человеческий капитал», рынок дополнительных образовательных услуг

Ссылка для цитирования:

Лобазова О. Ф. Факторы развития российского рынка дополнительного профессионального образования // Перспективы науки и образования. 2020. № 5 (47). С. 451-464. doi: 10.32744/pse.2020.5.32

O. F. LOBAZOVA

Factors of development of the Russian additional professional education market

The results of the activities of higher education institutions in the field of additional professional education do not always reach high rates, which affects the process of implementing the state policy of labor market modernization. The hypothesis of this study was based on the assumption of a complex of conditions, in which the offers in the additional professional education market are formed, and which can be considered as a group of related but not homogeneous factors.

To form the empirical base of the study, the authors selectively collected open data posted on the official websites of educational organizations on the Internet, which were then statistically and meaningfully processed using the systemic method.

As a result, it was found that offers in the market of additional professional education services are formed under the influence of a number of objective factors, which are designated in the study as "standard, progress, market and fashion" factors. The application of this model to the analysis of the actual state of the additional professional education market made it possible to formulate three principles of effective organization, abiding by which some educational organizations obtain benchmark results: fields-of-study differentiation, functions delegation, and price diversification.

Thus, the study made it possible to identify the most effective directions of the organizational activities of universities in the field of additional professional education and to formulate a number of provisions of practical significance. The prospect of the study is a factor analysis of further changes in that part of the additional professional education market, which is made up of state higher education institutions.

Keywords: additional professional education, professional retraining, advanced training, "human capital", the market of additional educational services

For Reference:

Lobazova, O. F. (2020). Factors of development of the Russian additional professional education market. *Perspektivy nauki i obrazovania – Perspectives of Science and Education*, 47 (5), 451-464. doi: 10.32744/pse.2020.5.32

Introduction

The authors think that there will always be groups in society that differ in their attitude toward the main line of civilization development: first, groups personally promoting scientific-technological progress; second, those who actively use its achievements; and third, those who are poorly responsive to social challenges. Such groups were and still exist in any community, but their number and role in social production changes over time. At present, in those societies that can be considered technologically advanced, the majority of the adult population cannot but take into account scientific, technical, and socio-economic changes. The changes taking place in production technologies are so rapid that they force people to constantly update their general and special knowledge and skills. This sets more complex tasks for the education system, which are comprehended by society in the form of certain paradigms (in more general terms, this is the concept of lifelong learning). The purpose of creating a multi-stage, practically lifelong learning is the formation of “human capital”.

There are many publications on the ways and means of forming “human capital”. For example, Tavares writes about such a way of transferring relevant skills as replacing skilled workers to new production areas and mentoring: “As firm-specific human capital is embodied in the workers, it may be supplied to the new unit by internally transferring workers” [1]. There are different views on whether the content of “human capital” is universal, or whether each sphere of production forms its own specific requirements for it. For example, Cunningham and Mohr assume that “sales, service and administrative occupations use few tools and the most valuable human capital is in the mastery of cognitive and abstract tasks. In professional and blue-collar occupations, tool mastery, as measured by the number of job-specific tools used, is likely to be a valuable form of human capital” [2]. Gathmann and Schönberg share a similar view, noting the diversity of tasks the workers of different categories face [3].

Most authors (for example, Firpo *et al.* [4] or Cunningham and Mohr [5]) agree that “human capital” has criteria for its measurement and, upon the results of its assessment, wages should be formed. However, this does not always happen, which is also noted in these publications.

In addition, it is noted that sociological studies [6] provide information about some change in the interests of employers, who increasingly think that for effective work, a modern worker requires not only basic and specialized professional skills (core skills) but also universal behavioral skills (soft skills).

Economic theory proposes to consider “human capital” as a stock of knowledge, skills, and abilities used by a person in the process of his/her production activities, and therefore it brings profit – both to the person and to his/her employer. In the philosophical aspect, “human capital” is considered in a much broader way – it includes as an integral part not only those personality traits that can be monetized, but also those that do not bring benefits at all, but, on the contrary, call for self-sacrifice. However, the authors will build on the definition that is characteristic of economic theory, since the purpose of this article is to identify the features of organization of the university system of additional professional education (hereinafter referred to as “APE”), depending on the state of the socio-economic and scientific-technological capacity of society.

There is a steady interest in the Russian APE practice in the domestic scientific literature, which is expressed in a variety of publications on this topic. The authors use various approaches to solving the problem of increasing the efficiency of the APE system. For example, Konchenkova insists that it is necessary to assimilate “the best from the era of the digital economy and simultaneously return to the qualitative characteristics of Soviet education” [7, p. 383]. Others, for example, Sirik [8], see the solution to the problem of APE effectiveness in the improvement of labor legislation and the general set of APE governing standards.

Positive results are expected from APE activities for different sectors of social and economic life. Thus, Kononova [9] draws attention to the retraining of preretirement people, while Zakieva [10] focuses on improving the qualifications of middle-aged workers.

Forecasts are made regarding the APE development, its formal and substantive parts. For example, Bondarenko is sure that in the near future, there will be a clear increase in the interest of company management “in the development of social, communication skills and learning ability of all groups of workers” [11, p. 281]. Kopytova agrees with this view [12], noting the importance of supra-professional (general cultural and essentially universal) competencies.

However, the problems of APE are often analyzed in scientific publications based on the principle of additional education (hereinafter referred to as “AE”) as a whole, the understanding of which is concentrated in the term “lifelong learning”. In this regard, APE is described as having such characteristics that are absolutely not inherent in it. For example, independence from government standards [13], or the conversation about professional retraining (hereinafter referred to as “PR”) and advanced training (hereinafter referred to as “AT”) begins with a discussion of the “social mission of universities” [14], which should give society a part of the accumulated potential free of charge. Both of these provisions are incorrect, since, first, the content and form of APE is directly determined by state standards and, second, it is extremely rare free of charge.

As far as APE is concerned, the discussion is limited to particular tasks – availability of computer equipment and literacy of students, methods of preparing and conducting specific types of classes [15], feedback technology from course participants, reports on the transition to a new form of programs [16]. Among the array of publications in the Russian Science Citation Index on the topic of AE, APE, PR, and AT, there are very few works written by representatives of institutions where these educational services are really successfully provided.

Thus, despite the rich content of scientific discourse on similar issues, the research object is quite unconventional – it is the activity of a number of educational institutions and organizations working in the field of APE and providing services for PR and AT. The research subject is the features of rendering educational services within APE in modern conditions.

The purpose is to identify a complex of reasons and conditions that determine the development of the APE market.

Materials and methods

To achieve the purpose of the study, the authors collected and studied data on activities in the field of PR and AT of public and private educational institutions and organizations, posted on their official websites, as well as the data on information portals that concentrate information on adult education services. All educational organizations mentioned in the

study can be divided into several groups: 1) “universalists” are educational institutions and organizations where APE is not the main activity. There are three subgroups in this group: a) the “reference subgroup” – it includes the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (RANEPA) and the National Research University “Higher School of Economics” (NRU HSE) as examples of success, and not only in APE; b) the “typical subgroup” includes RUDN University named after P. Lumumba and Tomsk State University as examples of classical universities with a diverse set of faculties and fields of study; c) the “special subgroup” includes the Moscow State Psychological and Pedagogical University (MSPPU), Bauman Moscow State Technical University as examples of activities in the field of APE in those universities that have a relatively narrow specialization of fields of study; 2) the “major-based” group includes educational institutions and organizations where APE is the main (and only) activity. There are two subgroups in this group: a) the “budgetary group” consists of state educational organizations engaged in APE: for example, Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of APE “Institute for the Development of Additional Professional Education”; b) “private-sector participants” are private and joint-stock educational organizations engaged in APE.

The methods used in the study are classified as general scientific ones (analysis, synthesis, induction, and deduction as general logical procedures; description and comparison as empirical methods and the system method as a tool of the theoretical level of knowledge).

The research methodology was determined by the content of the concept of “APE”.

It should be noted that in terms of formal logic, the term “APE” contains an inaccuracy. Both of its constituent parts (AT and PR) are interpreted by the law “On Education in the Russian Federation” as training [17]. However, taken together, they are called education. Although, the difference between education and training is obvious. A number of authors pay attention to it. For example, Lawson notes that “‘education’ implies a concern for moral and evaluative issues consistent with a Humanistic approach, whereas ‘training’ being task and role oriented can ignore moral issues in the interests of efficient performances” [18, p. 98]. Training, as a preparatory process for rewarding activities, and education that everyone needs, even those excluded from paid employment, should be considered separately, according to Forrester et al. [19].

Taking into account all these opinions and supporting them, in demarcating the subject of this study, the definitions of APE components were taken into account: PR – training aimed at obtaining new qualifications necessary for the implementation of professional activities; AT – training aimed at improving the already existing qualifications of a specialist.

Results

The state program of the Russian Federation “Development of Education” for 2013–2020 contains target indicators reflecting the need to expand the coverage of the country’s adult population with this type of education. It was planned to increase the share of the employed population aged 25–65 who have undergone AT and (or) vocational training up to 37 percent by 2015. However, according to some estimates [20, p. 25] in 2017, only 27% of the population aged 25–64 participated in lifelong learning.

Despite the conservatism, inertia, and over-regulation of the education system (and these are its generic characteristics, without which this system is not formed as an institution for the transfer of important social experience), modern education responds to the challenges

of the time and, listening to the demands of social practice, makes adjustments to its educational plans and methods of teaching and primarily in the APE system.

These changes are influenced by several factors:

- a) “Standard factor”, which is manifested in the availability of state standards for verification of qualifications;
- b) “Progress factor”, which influences through the expansion of the list of publicly available technical and social innovations;
- c) “Market factor”, which reflects the structural changes in the economy;
- d) “Fashion factor”, which reflects the variability of the attitudes of public consciousness (fashion for professions).

The detailed information about the listed factors is given below.

“Standard factor”. The state has identified fields and programs of study, for which AT is mandatory. These are medical professionals, government officials, and teaching staff. They must take AT courses every three years. In this regard, all participants in the APE services market offer courses on a grand scale in these fields of study and certain majors.

For example, on the 10th of June, the website “Ucheba.Ru” informed about 1,203 AT and PR courses in Moscow, with the validity date from June 10 to December 30, 2020. The first place is taken by courses in medicine (20.6% of all offers), a significant place is given to pedagogy and psychology (20.2%), the group of fields of study from management to records management looks impressive (if they are taken into account together – 18%), economics and all related types of activities are also more significant in number than others (8% of offers). It is predictable that there are many courses in information technologies (6.2%) and foreign languages (5.7%). The rest of the offers in specific fields of study amounts to 0.3–1.5% in each case.

Peoples’ Friendship University of Russia named after P. Lumumba (RUDN University) offers 1,183 PR and AT courses. Medicine is a leading field of study here too (but this is due to the fact that RUDN University has a faculty of medicine), followed by the humanities and social sciences, and this position of the humanities and social sciences is a property of the university, not a general trend (in general, the humanities and social sciences are not among the ten most in-demand). Pedagogy and psychology come third – in this case, the coincidence of the university specialization with general trends can be seen. Again, the coincidence of the trend with the specifics of the RUDN University is reflected in a large number of courses in foreign languages. One more trend implies the attention to such fields of study as jurisprudence, economics, governance and management; they also coincide with the university specialization.

Tomsk State University offers 355 PR and AT programs in accordance with the areas, in which the university specializes. Tomsk State University does not have a faculty of medicine; therefore, pedagogy comes first in terms of the number of APE offers (this field of study is offered by university departments). Thus, the “standard factor” also works in this case. The second, third and subsequent places in the number of courses are taken by management, IT technologies, ecology, and foreign languages. Note that the total number of 355 PR and AT courses is not a record and is not even included in the “top ten” APE leaders, which does not prevent Tomsk State University from being a noticeable phenomenon in Russian education, having the status of a national research university. It also should be noted that not all faculties of Tomsk State University work with APE programs: the Institute of Military Education, the Military Training Center, the Faculty of Mechanics and Mathematics and the Faculty of Radiophysics do not have APE courses at all.

“Progress factor”. Most branches of social production are rapidly computerizing. In this regard, IT technologies are in demand everywhere, and training of users of different levels is very popular. In addition, due to the involvement in global information processes, the need for knowledge of foreign languages is growing. Foreign language courses are offered everywhere.

For example, at Bauman Moscow State Technical University, APE is implemented in several formats: PR and AT courses are conducted at faculties, as well as at a separate unit – the Specialist Educational Center. The faculties implement a total of 6 PR programs and 51 AT programs. All of them are connected with information technologies. While the Specialist Educational Center offers as follows: 1) Programming courses; 2) Accounting and audit; 3) Marketing and advertising; 4) Internet marketing; 4) Data analysis and machine learning; 5) Microsoft Excel. The total number of courses in the Educational Center is more than 2,000. However, the main part is mainly in sections 1 and 4. In addition, there are 31 scientific and educational centers at MSTU, and the work on AE is also carried out in these centers – but only for students of some MSTU faculties and specialists of “closed” industries connected with the university. Thus, in this case, the “progress factor” turns out to be the leading one in determining the APE policy, but the “market factor” also has an impact – MSTU also offers courses in Marketing and Advertising and Internet Marketing.

“Market factor”. Structural changes in the economy initiated a significant growth in the layer of managers and organizers who are not involved in direct commodity production, and an increase in the share of the sector of services, sales, and related advertising. In this regard, all types of industry management, personnel management, marketing, and PR have become in demand. The same structural changes made banking and financial management in general, business management, risk management, and other programs relevant.

The Autonomous Non-Profit Organization of Additional Professional Education “National Technological University” offers services in 35 fields of study, among which governance and management, paperwork, personnel records management, HR, healthcare, nuclear industry (!), art history, oil and gas business, and fitness are peacefully coexisting. Thus, a person can get very versatile opportunities for little money.

The National Research Institute of Additional Education and Professional Training offers 609 programs in 19 PR and 20 AT fields of study. There are such diverse majors as management, marketing, advertising, personnel management and HR administration, design, defectology, and even pedagogy of AE (in this field of study, 37 training courses are offered!).

These examples are selected based on the results of search queries from among a huge number of offers. For example, in the Yandex search engine, the query “governance and management courses” gives about 11 million results, the query “personnel management courses” – 13 million results, the query “strategic management courses” – 8 million results, the query “state and municipal management courses” – 19 million results. PR and AT courses in management, personnel management, marketing, state and municipal management are offered by both government and non-government organizations.

“Fashion factor”. The attitudes of public consciousness contain both outdated guidelines (for economists, accountants, and lawyers) and new ones related to interior design, beauty industry, and healthy diet. This also actualizes a number of related professions that do not always require higher education – barista, make-up artist, barber, fitness trainer, etc. However, the specialty “psychology” and related personal growth training, which also turned out to be at the height of fashion, require higher education, which should have strengthened

the position of universities in the APE market, but in fact, fashion extends to positioning and self-promotion, not to qualifications. Therefore, “private-sector participants” react to the “fashion factor” faster and better, issuing certificates with loud names of nonexistent professions. However, state universities also respond to the demand of the population in their own way.

Implementing many courses in medicine, RUDN University offers courses in the field of medicine aesthetic – cosmetology, dietetics, and fitness, including it in physiotherapy exercises. Thus, it fits into fashion trends. Bauman Moscow State Technical University offers courses in psychology and leadership as part of a thematic group of “personal development”. Moscow State University of Psychology and Pedagogy (MSUPP) offers 121 PR and AT programs. All of them are focused on teachers and psychologists, i.e. in this case, two factors coincide – “standard” and “fashion” ones; however, the “fashion factor” only accompanies, and does not determine the activity, which already specializes in psychology.

Tomsk State University does not respond to fashion trends in any way: courses in psychology (only 2 in number) are taught by the Faculty of Psychology; and these programs are targeted at clinical professionals.

In addition to Tomsk State University, there are also small organizations that can afford not to react to changes in fashion. For example, the State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education of the Moscow Region “Academy of Social Management” (ASM), having among the implemented undergraduate fields of study the following ones – Management Psychology, Development of the Concept of a Hotel Product and Technologies for Its Promotion, Technology and Organization of Excursion Services, Project Management, Territorial Development Management, Human Resources Management, Digital State and Municipal Management. Nevertheless, for APE, it offers 113 programs exclusively for the education sector, i.e. it reacts only to the “standard factor”.

Among the “private-sector participants” there are much more of those who very quickly respond to fashion. For example, the Private Educational Institution of Additional Professional Education “International Academy of Expertise and Appraisal” with a legal address in Saratov offers more than 350 retraining and AT courses in a distance-learning format. It should be noted that in the “Other” category (147 items) one can find anything he or she wants: it is proposed to acquire a profession in the widest range – from a sommelier, beauty stylist and blogger to an astrologer and esotericist, from a sleep doctor to an allergist, and one can get any qualification for only 10,000 rubles with minimal intellectual costs.

The authors considered the economic efficiency of APE activities. On the official websites of organizations, there is no information on the financial results of APE activities, but they can be indirectly judged on the basis of prices for courses and the number of trainees (although it can be overestimated for advertising purposes). Even if the same price is fixed for all courses – 10,000 rubles, the proceeds from their sale are collected from the number of students. “Private-sector participants” choose this strategy most often: a low price combined with a maximum set of course topics, plus the lack of difficulties with the registration of admission, training, and obtaining final documents – all these aspects help to generate revenue.

However, Moscow organizations offer their services at higher prices than regional ones. For example, the Autonomous Non-Profit Organization of Additional Professional Education “Innovative Educational Center for Advanced Training and Retraining “My University” (Petrozavodsk, Karelia) offers courses at prices ranging from 488 to 5,100 rubles, although their topics and study load are not inferior to those in the capital (at least externally). The

APE sphere can generate income. Therefore, this is what numerous private organizations do. However, a state university does not always succeed in earning the planned (or desired) volume of revenues for all its APE programs. However, there are examples of very successful activities for APE development. They are provided below.

Principles of effective organization of APE activities.

In the indicators of any activity, which contains a commercial component, the patterns formulated by Pareto as the 80/20 rule can be found. They can also be seen in the work on promoting APE services – only some courses and topics give universities the greatest effect, both financial and image ones, while the rest of the variety of offers gives little result, although it takes a lot of effort for preparation, advertising, and implementation.

Based on the comparative analysis of APE activities of higher education institutions, one can formulate some principles that underlie effective activities: a) fields-of-study differentiation; b) functions delegation; c) price diversification.

The effect of these principles will be considered by the example of work on APE at RANEPa and NRU HSE. State funding associated with the tasks of these organizations and the status in the hierarchy of universities, the high authority in public opinion, and the quotation of diplomas – all this allows these organizations to act as standards in APE.

The principle of fields-of-study differentiation provides for the delineation of the areas of thematic specialization – only specialists (teams of specialists) with competitive advantages can and should deal with certain APE topics. The choice of priority areas or topics for APE depends mainly on the basic set of fields of study at the university.

For example, RANEPa offers 47 PR courses in six thematic areas and 129 AT courses in nine areas. Whereas there are 27 full-time training courses at RANEPa (bachelor and specialty programs). Only one-third of the full-time programs at the academy are converted into APE programs. RANEPa's distinctive feature is management in all spheres, which is reflected in thematic areas of the APE offers (66% in PR courses and 80% in AT courses).

At NRU HSE, despite 80 full-time bachelor and specialist programs, 55 thematic sections are offered for 482 PR and AT courses. It means two-thirds of full-time educational programs are converted into APE. However, the figures given by thematic blocks are completely inconsistent with the total number of programs. The difference is striking between the number of courses offered by the department and the number of courses that are related to its subject. For example, according to the site, 90 PR courses and 337 AT courses in Philosophy are recommended, while the School of Philosophy as part of the Faculty of Humanities implements only one (!) APE program. It is also indicated that 87 PR and 292 AT programs in Pedagogical Education are offered, while the Institute of Education, as part of the Faculty of Social Sciences, implements only 29 PR and AT programs.

The authors had to look at the fields of study more closely. It turned out that on the NRU HSE website, the thematic sections included courses that are not developed specifically for fields of study, but are recommended for learning as a whole, as if a student studying in a particular field of study would want to acquire additional knowledge from other areas. Therefore, on the subject of Philosophy, the section contains courses 3D-Generalist, Full CG, Digital-Producer in Social Media, Master in Management “Logistics of Foreign Economic Activity – Foreign Economic Activity”, Product Manager – Digital Product Management, etc. subjects. On the one hand, this can be perceived as a reflection of a broad approach to the competencies of a specialist in the field of study “Philosophy”, but, on the other hand, this can be regarded as a kind of marketing ploy.

Thus, the principle of fields-of-study differentiation allows directing the main efforts to such topics that: a) are exclusive to the organization and will clearly outstrip all other similar offers in the market; b) are in massive demand due to the complex influence of the “standard”, “progress”, “market” and “fashion” factors.

The principle of functions delegation is embodied in the distribution of the study load of APE courses between the structural units of educational organizations. In the best possible way, this distribution is not based on equity participation, but on the selection of the most sought-after participants.

For example, in RANEPA's structure, there are 18 subdivisions, but the main APE study load is performed by three of them: the Institute of Industry Management (4 PR and 37 AT programs), the Institute of Law and National Security (1 PR and 23 AT programs) and the Institute of Finance and Sustainable Development (8 PR and 14 AT programs). RANEPA's work on APE does not provide for the obligatory participation of subdivisions – the Faculty of Economic and Social Sciences and the Federal Institute for Education Development do not conduct APE programs at all, which does not mean that they do not successfully carry out their main activities. Most likely, APE courses in these fields of study are not recognized as a priority, since there are other universities where this specialization is the main one.

In the structure of NRU HSE, 56 subdivisions conduct educational activities. There are clear leaders in APE programs: Faculty of Business and Management – 95 programs; Institute of Construction Industry, Housing and Utilities GASIS – 61 programs; Faculty of Social Sciences – 47 programs; Faculty of Communications, Media and Design – 47 programs; Institute for Professional Retraining of Specialists – 33 programs; Faculty of World Economy and International Affairs – 26 programs; School of Foreign Languages – 24 programs. At the same time, there are structural subdivisions that do not implement APE programs – there are 21 such subdivisions, including various faculties, institutes, departments, centers, and research laboratories. There are also subdivisions that carry out the minimum study load for APE: 4 subdivisions implement 1 program and 2 subdivisions implement 2 programs.

As in a similar case at RANEPA, one can confidently assume that a pragmatic approach to the choice of courses and their organizers has been implemented here. Priority was given to those topics and fields of study in which NRU HSE is a leader in its core activities, and from that standpoint, it can compete in APE.

It means, in accordance with the principle of functions delegation, that not all subdivisions conducting educational activities take part in the work on APE, but only those whose work in the field of APE can bring significant financial results or form image-building capital (like free courses of the Department of History at NRU HSE).

The principle of price diversification is implemented in the fact that the price of courses is set in a wide range, proceeding from the desire not only to make a profit but also to solve some other problems – to attract future applicants, form public opinion, direct interest in a certain area of social production, create a certain number of specialists with especially valuable qualifications, etc.

At RANEPA, it can be seen that the cost of courses is gradient. This apparently reflects an orientation toward individuals and legal entities as customers and includes allowances for credibility, in addition to labor costs. The high price of courses is a qualification barrier that can be overcome only by those who have formed a financial basis for reaching new social levels. The minimum cost of a PR program at RANEPA is 25,500 rubles, the maximum cost is 1,170,000 rubles. The minimum cost of AT programs is 10,000 rubles and the maximum cost is 367,000 rubles.

At NRU HSE, an even wider spread in the cost of courses is observed – the organization can afford to conduct some APE programs for free. Although in this case, one should talk about AE programs that increase the general cultural and educational level, but are not related to professional qualifications. The minimum price level for courses is 1,750 rubles, while the maximum price level is 500,000 rubles. It can be assumed that such a range of prices was approved for pragmatic reasons: relying on current-day and future customers, taking into account labor costs and the prestige of competencies, etc. Certainly, the prices for APE courses include ideas about the level of public opinion about the conversion of diplomas of this organization.

As a result, the variety of prices for APE courses attracts different categories of citizens. However, the most relevant courses have a high price, which serves as a filter for the selection of customers for APE services.

Borrowing, or at least taking into account in the work of those principles and techniques that have been developed by the leaders of Russian education, will help optimize the APE process of a higher education institution, even in cases where this institution does not have such initial positions as the examples considered.

Discussion

Additional education for adults is offered everywhere, but has its own characteristics in each country. For example, “lifelong learning of adults in Japan is one of the highest life values”; “the aim of lifelong learning of adults in Finland is to support the desire to extend the working life of the population”; while “the Swedish adult education system contributes to the development of democracy, raises the people’s cultural level” [21]. The content and forms of AE in Western countries are changing, and the issues of changing the demand for skills [22] or the relationship between the employee and the employer in the formation of working skills [23] are discussed in the framework of the lifelong learning concept, which is internationally recognized and causes a fairly high public interest.

APE in the Russian Federation is carried out by other forces and in different socio-economic conditions than in the developed countries of Europe and America. In those countries, “human capital” and “internal knowledge” (i.e. work experience in a specific organization) is the employer’s concern, who determines both the significant skills and the reward for their possession. The state of these countries is concerned to a greater extent not about improving the qualifications of workers, but about citizens without taking into account their profession – their level of readiness to adapt to new living conditions. Therefore, state institutions are more focused on addressing the AE issues, i.e. expanding general cultural competencies, outlook, and social skills (tolerance, for example), while employers are engaged in teaching new professional techniques and instrumental skills.

In Russia, the situation is not the opposite, but different – the state (represented by universities and special centers), corporations, and private educational organizations are also engaged in providing working adults with AE. Until now, only NRU HSE has been conducting a comprehensive study of the APE market and monitoring the education economics by order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation since 2002. However, this monitoring refers to APE only periodically and is based on a survey of some market participants – employers (in 2014) and employees (in 2018), who are the main customers of APE courses. The authors have considered the activities of those who provide APE services. The APE

experience of higher education institutions considered in this article (and this is only a part of the AE system) is subjective, since it is quite unique in each individual case. However, the factors that influence the formation of the features of APE development at higher education institutions are objective in nature and have an impact on the education system wherever modern socio-economic, scientific and technological changes occur. That is why the materials and conclusions can be useful to everyone who studies the evolution of labor resources, and especially to those who are involved in organizing APE in Russia and the post-Soviet space.

Conclusion

The comparative analysis of open data of educational organizations, carried out in the context of the author's concept of the factors of APE market development, made it possible to formulate several conclusions.

First, the “standard factor” influences the formation of supply in the APE market to a large extent. The overwhelming majority of the participants in the process offer APE services in fields of study determined by the state as subject to mandatory additional training.

Second, the “progress factor” opens up wide opportunities for all universities participating in APE, but most of all it affects the market position of those actors whose specialization is related to the implementation of technical progress and, therefore, is updated by the requirements of the time.

Third, the “market factor” has the most powerful influence on the sector of the APE market occupied by private and non-profit educational institutions, but, undoubtedly, it also affects state universities.

Fourth, the “fashion factor” has an effect on all educational organizations. However, state universities can use it effectively only if their main specialization (or a set of specialties) makes it possible to declare the most relevant topics in general public opinion.

Fifth, the greatest effect from APE is obtained by those who do not just react to the indicated factors of influence, but can use several factors at once due to special circumstances.

The most effective principles for organizing APE of higher education institutions are as follows:

- Fields-of-study differentiation. The topics of APE courses are determined by internal (university profile and potential) and external conditions (the needs of the economy, as well as the place of a university in the official and unofficial ranking).
- Functions delegation. The distribution of APE study load between the university departments is based not on the number of full-time employees, but on the choice of priority thematic areas in which the university can compete in the educational services market, and on the selection of relevant executing institutions.
- Price diversification. The cost of the courses depends on both the expected capabilities of the potential customer and the social necessity of the proposed topic.
- Thus, it can be argued that the APE market in terms of supply is currently fully formed, all “niches” are filled with actors of different levels, among which there are clear leaders and outsiders. It becomes more difficult for the APE university system to work and achieve planned targets. Nevertheless, with a properly established system for APE organization, a university can not only replenish its extra-budgetary funds, but, first and foremost, influence the functioning of the production sphere and change the lives of workers for the better.

Funding

This work is funded by the Russian State Social University upon the results of the study “Analysis of target markets of university educational services” for individual number Lot No. 1, Order dated April 30, 2020 No. 530, Order dated May 26, 2020 No. 593.

REFERENCES

1. Tavares, M.F.F. (2020). Across Establishments, within Firms: Worker's Mobility, Knowledge Transfer and Survival. *Journal for Labour Market Research*, 54(2).
2. Cindy, M. (2019). Cunningham and Robert D. Mohr. Using Tools to Distinguish General and Occupation-Specific Skills. *Journal for Labour Market Research*, 53(6).
3. Gathmann, C., & Schönberg, U. (2010). How General Is Human Capital? A Task-Based Approach. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 28(1), 1–49.
4. Firpo, S., Fortin, N.M., & Lemieux, T. (2011). Occupational Tasks and Changes in the Wage Structure. *IZA Discussion Paper*, 5542.
5. Cunningham, C., & Mohr, R.D. (2017). Wage and Job Skill Distributions in the National Compensation Survey. *Monthly Labor Review*, 140, 1.
6. European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training. (2013). *Piloting a European Employer Survey on Skill Needs: Illustrative Findings*. Cedefop Research paper No. 36. Luxembourg.
7. Konchenkova, T.N. (2019). Employment of the Population of the Constituent Entities of the Russian Federation and Directions for Improving the System of Personnel Training, Retraining and Advanced Training in the Digital Economy. In *XXXII International Plekhanov Readings. Collection of Articles of Graduate Students and Young Scientists* (pp. 383–388).
8. Sirik, M.S. (2020). The Employee's Right to Professional Training, Retraining and Advanced Training. In *Modern View of Science and Education: Collection of Scientific Articles* (pp. 227–229). Moscow.
9. Kononova, Yu.V. (2020). Advanced Training of Preretirement People as One of the Ways of Distributing Labor Resources. In *Legal Science in the 21st Century: Current Problems and Prospects for Their Solutions. Collection of Scientific Articles upon the Results of the Round Table with All-Russian and International Participation* (pp. 10–11).
10. Zakieva, R.R. (2019). Retraining and Advanced Training of Employees and Specialists. *Scientific Research and Development. Modern Communication Studies*, 8(3).
11. Bondarenko, N.V. (2015). Lifelong Education as a Factor of Human Capital Accumulation. *Scientific Articles – Institute of Economic Forecasting of the Russian Academy of Sciences*, 13, 276–299.
12. Kopytova, S.M. (2018). Supraprofessional Competencies as a Condition for the Professionalism of a Specialist and Their Formation in the Adult Additional Education System. *Izvestiya by Voronezh State Pedagogical University*, 2(279), 77–81.
13. Biryukova, N.A. (2016). Assessment of the Personal Development of an Adult as an Indicator of the Quality of Additional Education. *Education and Science*, 6(135), 141–151.
14. Volnistaya, M.G. (2018). Social Mission of Universities and Additional Education for Adults. In *Current Trends in Additional Education for Adults. Materials of the IV International Scientific and Methodological Conference* (pp. 229–231).
15. Kravchenko, Yu.V. (2019). Additional Education for Adults: Features and Some Problems. *Epoch of Science*, 20, 543–546.
16. Kostenko, O.V., Solomatina, L.A., Tatarinova, I.V., & Koltunova, S.N. Updating the Structure of APE Programmes According to Modern Requirements. *Multi-Specialty Hospital*, 6(2), 172–175.
17. *Federal Law No. 273-FZ (as amended of June 8, 2020) "On Education in the Russian Federation", Article 75. Additional Education for Children and Adults*. (2012, December 29). Retrieved June 10, 2020, from http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_140174/2f0cff66d896f7b9817e26dba7e5f3207df5c43e/
18. Lawson, K. (2006). Lifelong Education: Concept or Policy? *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 1(2), 97–108.
19. Forrester, K., Payne, J., & Ward, K. Lifelong Education and the Workplace: A Critical Analysis. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 14(4), 292–305.
20. Bondarenko, N.V. (2018). Lifelong Education of the Adult Population in Russia: Involvement, Sources of Funding and the Main Effects of Participation. *Monitoring the Economics of Education. News Bulletin*, 12(132).
21. Klishevich, N.S., & Khatskevich, O.V. Additional Education for Adults as an Idea of Lifelong Learning: International Experience. In *Current Trends in Additional Education for Adults. Materials of the IV International Scientific and*

Methodological Conference (pp. 248–251).

22. Beaudry, P., Green, D.A., & Sand, B.M. (2016). The Great Reversal in the Demand for Skill and Cognitive Tasks. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 34(S1), 199–247.
23. Mane, F., & Miravet, D. (2016). Using the Job Requirements Approach and Matched Employer-Employee Data to Investigate the Content of Individuals' Human Capital. *Journal for Labour Market Research*, 49(2), 133–155.

Информация об авторе

Лобазова Ольга Федоровна

(Россия, Москва)

Доцент, доктор философских наук, профессор
кафедры философии
Российский государственный социальный
университет

E-mail: lobazovaof@gmail.com

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-8601-6665

Information about the author

Olga F. Lobazova

(Russia, Moscow)

Associate Professor,
Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Professor of the
Department of Philosophy
Russian State Social University

E-mail: lobazovaof@gmail.com

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-8601-6665